

WEST VIRGINIA
SECRETARY OF STATE
KEN HECHLER
ADMINISTRATIVE LAW DIVISION

Form #4

Do Not Mark In this Box

48 FD

2012 MAR 13

NOTICE OF RULE MODIFICATION OF A PROPOSED RULE

AGENCY: STATE TAX DEPARTMENT TITLE NUMBER: 110

CITE AUTHORITY W. VA. CODE §§ 29A-3-15 AND 11-10-5

AMENDMENT TO AN EXISTING RULE: YES X NO

IF YES, SERIES NUMBER OF RULE BEING AMENDED: 1

TITLE OF RULE BEING AMENDED: APPRAISAL OF PROPERTY FOR PERIODIC
STATEWIDE REAPPRAISALS FOR AD VALOREM PROPERTY TAX PURPOSES

IF NO, SERIES NUMBER OF NEW RULE BEING PROPOSED:

TITLE OF RULE BEING PROPOSED:

THE ABOVE PROPOSED LEGISLATIVE RULE, FOLLOWING REVIEW BY THE LEGISLATIVE RULE MAKING REVIEW COMMITTEE IS HEREBY MODIFIED AS A RESULT OF REVIEW AND COMMENT BY THE LEGISLATIVE RULE-MAKING REVIEW COMMITTEE. THE ATTACHED MODIFICATIONS ARE FILED WITH THE SECRETARY OF STATE.


MICHAEL E. CARYL
STATE TAX COMMISSIONER

11.04. Valuation of Active and Reserve Coal
Properties.

(a) General. -- Coal is one of the several estates in real property which may be owned either as a separate interest or in conjunction with other interests, usually as fee ownership or as mineral ownership. If coal is owned as a separate estate, either absolute or as a leasehold interest, or in conjunction with other interests, West Virginia property tax law requires such ownership to be listed, valued and taxed based on its true and actual value. Coal may be owned without being mined. Coal rights may exist where no coal is actually present, or where the coal is unmineable or mined out. For valuation purposes this regulation classifies coal property ownership into the following categories:

- (1) Active
- (2) ~~Active/reserves~~ Reserves
- (3) ~~Inactive/reserves~~ Unmineable
- (4) Mined-out/~~Unmineable~~/Barren

(b) Definitions.

- (1) Acres Mined. -- Acres mined per year is the average annual production as defined in section 11.04(b)(4) (3) of these rules divided by the product of the thickness (in feet) of the coal seam being mined as detailed in mining permit times 1800 tons per acre foot times the recovery

rate according to the actual recovery of coal per acre being experienced at the mining operation.

$$\frac{\text{Average Annual Production}}{\text{Thickness} \times 1800 \times \text{Recovery Rate}} = \frac{\text{Annual Acres Mined}}{\text{Mined}}$$

(2) Active Mining Property. -- This term refers to a mineable ~~and/merchantaible~~ seam of coal on a parcel involved in a mining operation. For the purposes of determining active mining property, all contiguous parcels ~~under/one/ownership/or owned/or/leased/by/inter-related/businesses/or individuals~~ regardless of ownership, that are under lease and/or involved in the permitted operation shall be treated as ~~one/parcel~~ active mining property. The maximum active mining portion for each seam for each mining operation on a parcel is fifteen (15) years times the acres mined [as defined in section 11-04(b) (1) of these rules] for deep mines or ~~ten/(10)~~ five (5) years times the acres mined for surface and auger mines. If the mineable ~~and/merchantaible~~ acreage remaining in the seam(s) being mined is less than the maximum amounts listed above, then the remaining acreage will be considered the active mining property. If more than one seam on a parcel is being actively mined, then each such seam represents separate active mining property. In the application of the herein provided valuation

formula on "active mining property," the appropriate formula calculation will be based upon the actual market to which the coal from the tract and seam is currently being sold, whether it is "metallurgical" or "steam".

If more than one mining operation is mining a given coal seam on the same parcel, then each such mining operation has a separate active mining property. However, under no circumstances shall the sum of the active acres for all mining operations on a seam exceed the number of acres on a parcel. As necessary, the Commissioner shall apportion the number of acres for each mining operation, based upon a review of relevant leases, and the respective rates of average annual production.

(3) // Active Reserves // ++ This term means and includes the entire residual acreage of mineable and merchantable coal for each seam being actively mined in excess of the active mining property; or the number of acres corresponding to twenty-five (25) years times the acres mined per year as/11.0A(3)(1) // whichever is less // In the application of the herein provided valuation formula on "active reserves," the appropriate formula calculation

will be based upon the actual market to which
the coal from that tract and seam is currently
being sold, whether it is "metallurgical" or
"steam."

(4) (3) Average Annual Production. -- The
average annual rate of coal production, in
tons per fiscal year, ending June 30th of
each calendar year, is generally determined
by a weighted average of three (3) years net
production that has occurred between July 1
and June 30 of the most current fiscal years.

The weighted average shall be determined
by multiplying the most recent year's production
by .4, the previous two (2) years production
multiplied by .3, and the resulting three (3)
figures added together to arrive at the
average annual production. However, if there
is no production during the most recent
fiscal year then the property will be valued
as ~~inactive~~ reserves.

When there has been no production during
the second or third most recent fiscal year,
the production for the current year will be
factored by .5 and the production for the
earlier fiscal year in which production
existed will be factored by .5 and the

resulting two figures will be added together to arrive at the average annual production.

If there was no production in both the second and third most recent fiscal years then the production for the most recent fiscal year will be factored by 1.0 and the resulting figure will be the average annual production.

(3) (4) Barren. -- Those properties where coal rights are separately and/or individually Fee properties, mineral properties and/or those coal properties where the coal rights are owned, and the existence of one or more coal seams has not been established.

(4) (5) Capitalization Rate. -- A rate used to convert an estimate of income into an estimate of market value. [For further explanation see section 11.04(a)(1)(C) of these rules.]

(5) Inactive Reserves. -- Inactive reserves are those seams of coal, or portions thereof, which are mineable and merchantable but are not active mining property, or active reserves.

(6) (6) Life of Mining Operation. -- The life of a deep mining operation shall be fifteen (15) years, or the number of years

required to exhaust the seam at the average annual production [section 11.04(b)(4) (3) of these rules] rate, whichever is less. The life of a surface or auger mining operation shall be ~~ten~~ (10) five (5) years, or the number of years required to exhaust the seam at the average annual production rate, whichever is less. Fractional years will be rounded to the nearest whole number.

(9) // Merchantable Coal // ++ Coal which is ordinarily used for sale and can usually be sold at a profit.

(10) (7) Metallurgical Coal. -- This term shall mean bituminous coal that is suitable for making coke by industries that refine, smelt, and work with iron and/or steel.

(11) (8) Mineable Coal. -- Coal which can be mined under present day mining technology and economics. Coal which is so situated that it may be mined using generally accepted mining practices and suitable equipment and which is of such quality so as to be commercially saleable (as either mined coal or as a recoverable reserve). Furthermore, unless there is evidence to the contrary, coal seams which are of a thickness less than 30 inches

will not be considered or classified as mineable.

(12) (9) Mined-Out. -- A seam of coal, or any portion thereof, which is depleted by prior mining operations and which is not mineable ~~and/or merchantable~~ by modern technology.

(13) (10) Mining Operation. -- This term shall mean an enterprise engaged in actively obtaining or preparing to obtain coal or its by-products from the earth's crust, including underground, surface and auger mines. Each mining operation may have more than one area designated as "Active Mining Property" as defined in Section 11.04(b) (2) of these rules. The designation of "Active Mining Property" areas shall be determined as follows:

- (i) If the mining operation is producing coal from one seam under a Department of Natural Resources or Department of ~~Mines~~ Energy permit, then that operation will be designated as an "Active Mining Property." However, if the mining operation is producing coal from more than one seam under a Department of Natural Resources or Department of ~~Mines~~

Energy permit, then each active seam will be designated as an "Active Mining Property."

(ii) If the mining operation is producing coal from one seam at different portals and/or faces under one specific Department of Natural Resources or Department of ~~Mines~~ Energy permit, then that operation will be designated as an "Active Mining Property." However, if the production of coal involves different mining techniques (e.g. surface, auger or deep mining method), or if mining sites are separate and generally independent, then such sites will be designated as separate "Active Mining Properties."

(14) (11) Multiplier. -- This term shall mean the "present worth of one per period" for the life of the mining operation [section 11.04(b) (8) (7) of these rules] employing the capitalization rate determined in section 11.04(c) (1) (C) (I) of these rules, as determined by a standard mid-year life Inwood table.

(12) Recovery Rate. -- This, which is also known as mining height, is the percentage of

the marketable coal seam thickness that is recovered through the mining process.

(13) Reserves -- Reserves are those seams of coal, or portions thereof, which are mineable and contain recoverable coals, but are not active mining property.

~~(13)~~ (14) Royalty Rate. -- The royalty rates determined annually by the Tax Commissioner are the current market royalty rates for arms-length, willing-buyer, willing-seller, transactions for each of the four categories of coal mining operations derived in section 11.04(c) ~~(13)~~ (1) (F) of these rules. The royalty rates are deemed to be paid to each owner of a coal estate for all actively mined property, and are not generally considered to contain payments for property tax purposes.

~~(14)~~ (15) Steam Coal. -- This term shall mean bituminous coal that is mineable ~~and merchantable~~ but that is not suitable for making coke by industries that refine, smelt, and work with iron and/or steel.

(16) Thickness. -- This, which is also known as seam height, is the measurement of all visible coal, including any thinner coals

(splits) seen above or below the main block of coal.

(17) Unmineable Coal. -- Coal which is not mineable ~~and/merchandise~~ as defined above.

(18) 1800 Tons per Acre-foot. -- The specific gravity of bituminous coal ranges between 1.15 - 1.5 depending on rank, moisture and ash content, and averages 1.32.

$$1800 \text{ Tons/Ac. Ft.} = \frac{62.4 \text{ lbs/Ft}^3 \text{ of water} \times 43,560 \text{ Ft}^3 \text{ Ac/Ft} \times 1.32}{2,000 \text{ lbs/ton}}$$

(c) Valuation Methods.

(1) Method for Determining Value of Active Mining Property.

(A) General. -- The value of active mining property shall be the ~~average~~ annual/production/times/a/royalty/rate times/a/multiplier value per active acre times the amount of active acres.

(Active Acres are described in Section 11.04(b)(2) of these rules.. In no case will the active mining property be valued at less than its value as ~~inactive~~ reserve property.

(B) Value per Active Acre. -- The value per active acre is determined through the following formula:

$$\frac{\text{Thickness (ft.)}}{\times 1800 \text{ Tons Per Acre Foot}}$$

State Tax Department
Title 110
Series 1

x Recovery Rate
x Royalty Rate (steam) (deep or surface)
x % Steam Coal Market
x Multiplier
÷ (Mine Life (yrs))
(Plus) Thickness (ft.)
x 1800 Tons Per Acre Foot
x Recovery Rate
x Royalty Rate (metallurgical)
(deep or surface
x % Metallurgical Coal Market
x Multiplier
÷ (Mine Life (yrs.))

(C) Thickness (ft.). -- See definition
in section 11.04(b)(16) of these rules.

(D) 1800 Tons Per Acre - Foot. -- See
definition in section 11.04(b)(18) of
these rules.

(E) Recovery Rate. -- See definition in
section 11.04(b)(12) of these rules.

(F) Royalty Rate. -- For use in
the formula prescribed by this regu-
lation, the royalty rate(s) shall be
determined for each of the following
four (4) different types of coal mining
operations.

- (1) Deep mines, steam coal;
- (2) Deep mines, metallurgical
coal;
- (3) Surface and auger mines, steam
coal; and

(4) Surface and auger mines,
metallurgical coal.

These royalty rates shall be established annually by the Tax Commissioner after a review of recorded, willing seller-willing buyer arms-length coal property leases that have occurred in the State of West Virginia during at least the last five (5) years ~~the eight (8) years~~ (W/Va Code § 11-1A-3) prior to the appraisal date and through inspection of any other appropriate information. The review will place a greater emphasis on the information and leases transacted during the most recent years. The Tax Commissioner will maintain and publish this survey (report) on royalty rates (which will include the preliminary rates) on or before ~~March~~ May 31 of each year; will accept written public comment on the survey until ~~May 1~~ June 15 of each year; and issue the final royalty rates on or before July 1 of each year. This survey of royalty rates will be constructed (to the maximum possible extent) to indicate the following:

(1) county in which leased property is located, (2) deed book, page number, (3) lessor-lessee, (4) date recorded, (5) acreage involved, (6) seams involved, (7) type of mining operation, and (8) consideration made. ~~Those/cases/where the/leasehold/transaction/fails/to contain/a/royalty/consideration/will/not be/included/in/the/survey/~~ From this survey, the Tax Commissioner will select the royalty rate(s) that best typify such transactions. In order to convert percentage royalty rates into specific dollars per ton rates, the Tax Commissioner will separately conduct a review of West Virginia coal selling prices, and select specific selling price rate(s) based on prices best typifying activity in each appraisal year. The selected selling price(s) per ton when multiplied by the percentage royalty will result in the specific dollar per ton royalty rate factor.

(G) % Steam and Metallurgical Coal Market. -- See discussion in Section 11.04(b)(2) of these rules.

(H) Amount of Active Acres. -- The maximum amount of active acres for each active mining property will be 15 years times acres mined for deep mines and 5 years times acres mined for surface and auger mines.

(I) Capitalization Rate. -- The capitalization rate will be developed considering the techniques found in general practice in the appraisal profession when developing an income approach valuation estimate. Below is a listing of terms and definitions employed in developing various capitalization rate indicators.

(1) Definitions.

(i) Bands of Investment Discount Component. -- A discount rate derived by assigning rates to various debt and equity investment financing tiers and summing these rates, weighted by their respective percentages of total financing.

(ii) Discount Component. -- A rate reflecting a provision for returning to an investor a sum of money equal to the aggregate of the anticipated return-on-investment over the economic life of an investment.

(iii) Economic Life Method of Recapture. -- A method of developing a recapture rate by estimating the period of time an investment will produce a return and estimating an equal periodic rate of recapture of the investment over this return period.

(iv) Management Rate. -- A rate reflecting a return to an investor for the management of similar investment portfolios.

(v) Market Comparison Discount. -- A discount rate derived by dividing income net of the recapture component and property taxes by the arms-

length selling price of the property.

(vi) Market Comparison Method of Recapture. -- A recapture rate estimated by dividing income net of the discount component and property taxes by the arms-length selling price of the property.

(vii) Non-liquidity Rate. -- A rate reflecting a return to an investor representing the loss of interest on an investment arising from the time required to sell the investment.

(viii) Property Tax Component. -- A rate reflecting a provision for returning to an investor a sum of money equal to property taxes paid over the economic life of an investment.

(ix) Recapture Component. -- A rate reflecting a provision for returning to an investor a sum of money equal to his investment.

(x) Risk Rate. -- A rate reflecting a return to an investor necessary to attract capital to an investment containing a possible loss of principal and/or interest.

(xi) Safe Rate. -- A rate reflecting a return to an investor on an investment which has little, if any, livelihood of loss of principal or anticipated return on investment.

(xii) Summation Discount Component. -- A discount rate expressed as the aggregate of a safe rate, risk rate, non-liquidity rate, and management rate.

(2) Discussion. -- The capitalization rate as defined in Section 11.04(b)(6) (5) of these rules will be determined annually by the Tax Commissioner through the use of generally accepted methods for estimating such rates. The rate so

developed will consider a level-terminal income series which is indicative of active mining properties. The capitalization rate used to value active mining properties will be developed giving consideration to the following three (3) approaches:

(a) Discount Component

(i) Market Comparison.

-- Sufficient sales data permitting, the market comparison technique will be employed as the primary indicator for an appropriate discount component. The market comparison discount component will be developed by dividing aggregate royalty rate income streams adjusted for recapture by verified recorded arms-length sales transactions for active mining properties.

State Tax Department
Title 110
Series 1.

which have occurred in
the State of West Virginia
during the ~~eight~~/18Y five
(5) years 1W//VA//C0d0
\$/11+1A+3Y prior to the
annual appraisal date.
The market comparison
discount component
selected will be based
upon those rate indica-
tors best typifying
activity in this ~~eight~~
18Y five (5) year research
period. In selecting the
discount component
greater emphasis will be
given to information from
arms-length sales occurring
during the most recent
years of the study.

(ii) Summation Technique.

-- In the absence of
sufficient data to
statistically support
primary consideration of
the market comparison

technique, the summation techniques will be given primary consideration. The summation discount component will be developed reflecting the following four (4) major sub-components:

- (1) Safe Rate
- (2) Risk Rate
- (3) Non-liquidity
Rate
- (4) Management Rate

The "Safe Rate" will be developed through review of quarterly interest rates offered on thirteen (13) week United States Treasury Bills for a period of three (3) years prior to the appraisal date. The "Risk Rate" will be developed through review of data resulting from an annual survey of lending

State Tax Department
Title 110
Series 1

institutions, such survey reflecting interest rates required on loans for acquisition and/or development of coal properties. This survey will be conducted for a three (3) year period prior to the appraisal date. Results of the survey will be compared to quarterly interest rates offered on thirteen (13) week United States Treasury Bills for the same three (3) year period. An interest differential will then be selected representing the "Risk Rate." The "Non-liquidity Rate" will be developed through an annual survey to determine a reasonable estimate of time that coal properties remain on the market

before being sold. The market time thus determined will be used to identify United States Treasury Bills with similar time differentials in excess of thirteen (13) week Treasury Bills. The interest differential between these securities will be deemed to be representative of the "Non-liquidity Rate." The "Management Rate" will be developed through a survey of investment firms to identify charges for the management of investment portfolios.

(iii) Bands-of-Investment. --

Data permitting the Bands-of-Investment technique will be considered in conjunction with the two (2) previously mentioned discount estimate components.

(b) Recapture Component. --

Selection of a multiplier will be accomplished through access of a standard mid-year life Inwood table. The Inwood table has a factor for recapture built into the table coefficients. Inclusion of a recapture component in the capitalization rate is therefore not appropriate.

(c) Property Tax Component. --

This component will be derived by multiplying the assessment rate by the statewide average of tax rates on Class III property. At the present time research indicates that royalty rates do not include property taxes as a component. Thus, this component will not be used in the capitalization rate as defined in these regulations unless the above described general practice of the coal industry changes.

(3) The surveys referenced in Section 11.04(c)(1)(C) (I) (2) of these rules will be conducted and tentative results

published by the Tax Commissioner on or before ~~March~~ May 31 of each year.

Public comment on such surveys will be accepted until ~~May~~ June 15 of each year, and final results will be issued on or before July 1 of each year.

(2) // Valuation of Active Reserves.

(A) // General. //++// The value of each acre of active reserves shall be one tenth of the per acre value of active mining property.

(B) // Per Acre Value of Active Mining Property. //++// Per acre value of active mining property equals the value of active mining property as described in § 1110A(c)(1) divided by the number of acres in the active mining property.

(C) // In the event that the active reserve value per acre is less than the inactive reserve value per acre, the inactive reserve regional value per acre will be used.

12 (2) Valuation of Inactive Reserves.

15 (A) General. -- Inactive ~~r~~ Reserves shall be valued considering a review of sales reflecting arms-length, willing

buyer-willing seller transactions of such properties, and the market conditions in the region within which the property is located. The ~~inactive~~ coal reserve value shall be the product of the ~~inactive~~ reserve acres multiplied by the regional ~~inactive~~ reserve value per acre for the region in which the property is located.

(B) Review of ~~Inactive~~ Reserve Coal Property Sales. -- The values per acre for ~~inactive~~ reserves shall be established annually by the Tax Commissioner after review of recorded willing seller-willing buyer arms-length coal property sales that have occurred in the State of West Virginia during the ~~eight~~ five (5) years ~~W.V. Code § 11-1A-3~~ prior to the appraisal date, and through inspection of other appropriate information ~~including the effect of the size of the parcels on the per acre value.~~ This review will place a greater emphasis on the information and sales transacted during the most recent years. The Tax Commissioner will maintain and publish

this survey (report) of ~~inactive~~ coal property sales on or before ~~March~~ May 31 of each year; will accept written public comment on the survey until ~~May~~ June 15 of each year; and issue the final regional values per acre on or before July 1 of each year. This survey of ~~inactive~~ reserve coal sales will be constructed to indicate the following:

(1) county in which the property is located, (2) deed book, page number, (3) grantor-grantee, (4) date recorded, (5) acreage involved, (6) coal seams involved, (7) consideration, and (8) consideration per coal acre sold. From this survey, the Tax Commissioner will select the regional values per ~~inactive~~ acre that best typify such transactions.

(C) Inactive Reserve Regions. -- ~~Of the fifty-five counties in West Virginia, the State Geological and Economic Survey has identified that mineable and merchantable coal deposits occur only in forty-four counties.~~

The ~~forty-four~~ counties containing mineable, ~~merchantable~~ coal seams shall

be grouped into five (5) regions based on type of coal seams, location, ownership patterns, mining activity, and sale prices of ~~inactive~~ reserves.

(1) Region 1 - Brooke, Harrison, Marion, Marshall, Monongalia and Ohio Counties.

(2) Region 2 (No present mining) - Cabell, Calhoun, Doddridge, Hancock, Jackson, Pocahontas, Putnam, Roane, Tyler, Wetzel ~~and~~ Wirt, and Wood Counties and the northwest portion of Kanawha County (Jefferson, Union, Poca ~~Districts~~ , and part of Big Sandy and Elk Districts that lie north of Elk River).

(3) Region 3 - Barbour, Grant, Mineral, Preston, Randolph, Taylor, Tucker and Upshur Counties.

(4) Region 4 - Braxton, Clay, Gilmer, Greenbrier, Lewis, Mason, Nicholas and Webster Counties.

(5) Region 5 - Boone, Fayette, Lincoln, Logan, McDowell, Mercer, Mingo, Raleigh, Summers, Wayne and Wyoming Counties and the southeast

portion of Kanawha County (Washington, Malden, Loudon, Cabin Creek Districts, and part of Big Sandy and Elk Districts which lie south of Elk River).

Of the remaining eleven (11) counties, two (2), Jefferson and Hardy, have been classified as non-coal and the other nine (9), Berkeley, Morgan, Hampshire, Pendleton, Monroe, Jackson, Wood, Ritchie and Pleasants are listed as containing thin, unmineable seams.

If under any circumstances, the coal in any of the eleven (11) remaining counties not listed above becomes mineable and merchantable, that county will be classified in the appropriate region.

(D) Multiple Seam Parcels. -- For parcels containing more than one mineable merchantable seam, the inactive reserve portion of the seam(s) being mined are assigned 100% of the value determined by the method summarized in section 11.04(c) (3) of these rules. The remaining unmined, inactive reserve seams shall then be ranked according to their mineable merchantable acreages. The largest

reserve seam and the second largest reserve seam are each assigned 100% of the value determined by the method summarized in section 11.04(c)(3) (2) of these rules. The third largest unmined, ~~inactive~~ reserve seam is valued at 75% of the amount as determined by the methods summarized in section 11.04(c)(3) (2) of these rules. Subsequent reserve seams are each valued at 50% of the amount determined by the method summarized in section 11.04(c)(3) (2) of these rules. The final valuation of ~~inactive~~ reserves on a parcel is the sum of each of the individual valuations.

(4) // Valuation of Mined-Out/Unmineable/Barren/Coal Properties // Properties in this category shall be valued at \$1.00 per surface acre.

(3) Valuation of Unmineable Coal Properties.

Properties in this category will be valued under one of the following categories:

(A) Parcels in which each and every coal seam is unmineable or where each seam is partially unmineable and the remaining seam portion is mined out or barren, will be valued at \$5 per deed acre.

Example: 50 acre parcel -- 3 coal seams

- Seam #1 = 50.00 Ac Unmineable

- Seam #2 = 20.00 Ac Unmineable,

30.00 Ac Mined Out

- Seam #3 = 40.00 Ac Unmineable,

10.00 Ac Barren

Unmineable Value = 50.00 Ac(deed) x \$5 = \$250

(B) Parcels in which an acre or acres of unmineable coal exists in any seam will be valued at \$5 times the amount of unmineable acreage in the seam with the least amount of unmineable acreage.

Example: 50 acre parcel -- 3 coal seams

- Seam #1 = 40.00 Ac Mineable,

10.00 Ac Unmineable

- Seam #2 = 30.00 Ac Mineable,

20.00 Ac Unmineable

- Seam #3 = 35.00 Ac Mineable,

15.00 Ac Unmineable

Unmineable Value = 10 Ac Unmineable x \$5 = \$50*

*This value will be added to the reserve mineable acreage value to complete the property's coal valuation..

(4) Valuation of Mined Out/Barren Coal Properties

Properties in these categories will be valued under one of the following circumstances.

(A) Parcels in which each and every coal seam is completely mined out and/or barren,

will be valued at \$1.00 per deed acre.

Example: 100 acre parcel -- 2 coal seams

- Seam #1 = 100 acres mined out

- Seam #2 = 50 acres mined out,

50 acres barren

Value = 100 Ac (deed) x \$1 = \$100

(B) Parcels in which an acre or acres of
mined out/barren coal exists in any seam will
be valued at \$1 times the amount of mined
out/barren acreage in the seam with the least
amount of mined out/barren acreage.

Example: 100 acre parcel -- 2 coal seams

- Seam #1 = 90 acres mineable,

10 acres mined out

- Seam #2 = 80 acres mineable,

20 acres mined out

Value = 10 Ac Mined Out/Barren x \$1 = \$10*

* This value will be added to the reserve
mineable acreage value to complete the
property's coal valuation.

(5) Total Coal Valuation. -- The total coal
valuation for any coal parcel will involve the
value for all active acres, all reserve acres and
specific categories for unmineable and mined
out/barren acreage. Thus, the total amount of
coal acres valued for any parcel shall not be less
than the amount of deed acres, and total value for

State Tax Department
 Title 110
 Series 1

any coal parcel shall not be less than \$100.00.

(5) (6) Summary of Valuation Methods.

(A) Each/seam/on/those/properties/with
mineable/and/merchantable Properties that
involve coal shall be valued as follows.

Active/Mining/Property

(Average/////////Royalty//////////Active/Coal
/Annual/////////X///Rate/////////X///Multiplier///#///Real/Property
/Production/////////Per/Ton//////////Value
Active Mining Property

Value per Active Acre X Active Acres = Active Coal
Real Property
Value

Active/Reserve/Property

//////////Active/Reserve
/Active/////////Per/Acre/Value/of/////////Coal/Real/Prop
/Reserves///X///Active/Mining/Property///X/10%///erty/Value

Inactive/Reserve/Property

(Total//////////Regional/Per/Acre//////////Inactive/Coal
/Inactive/////////X///Inactive/Reserves/////////#///Reserves/Real
/Reserve/Acre//Value//////////Property/Value

Reserve Property

Regional Per Acre
Reserve Value X Reserve Acres X Seam Factor = Reserve
Real Property
Value

Unmineable Property

\$5 Per Acre X Deed Acres = Unmineable Coal
Real Property
Value

Mined Out Property

\$1 Per Acre X Deed Acres = Mined Out Coal
Real Property
Value

Barren Property

\$1 Per Acre X Deed Acres = Barren Coal
Real Property
Value

~~(B) // Mined-out, // unmineable and barren coal
properties shall be valued at One Dollar
(\$1.00) per surface acre.~~

(C) (B) The total value for coal properties will be the sum of the value of active mining property, ~~active reserves, // the inactive~~ reserves ~~and // the~~ unmineable, mined-out, ~~unmineable~~ and barren acres.

(D) (C) If other real property interests are owned in the coal property acreage, then the value of those additional interests shall be added to the total value of the coal properties to arrive at the total real property value.

(E) (7) Leasehold Interests. -- These regulations generally attribute the value of coal to the owner of the coal property. In those circumstances, however, where the owner of the property is subject to a lease requiring the owner to permit mining at royalty rates substantially below current market values, the owner may petition the Assessor, and on appeal, the Tax Commissioner, to attribute a portion of the value of the coal determined by this formula to the leaseholder.

(8) Active Farm Properties -- The coal rights, that are part of a "fee" estate where the use of the surface has qualified as an active farm, will be valued in the following manner:

(A) Where income or royalty is not derived from the coal rights (coal rights not leased or non-producing) the coal interest shall not be valued.

(B) Where income or royalty is derived from the coal rights (coal rights leased or producing) the coal interest shall be valued as follows:

(1) Fee estates where the annual wholesale value of farm commodities or products, is fifty percent (50%) or more of the usual annual gross income from all uses of the property, shall be subject to farm use valuation. Thus coal interests shall not be valued under this situation.

(2) Fee estates where the annual wholesale value of farm commodities or products is less than fifty percent (50%) of the usual annual gross income from all uses of the property, the

State Tax Department
Title 110
Series 1

applicable coal values shall be added to
the surface farm use value.

(9) Property Reports. -- Prior to November 1 of
each year the producer and coal owner will be
required to file reports with the assessor of the
county where the coal property is assessed. These
reports will be designed by the State Tax Commis-
sioner so that producing properties will be
reported by the producer (with acknowledgement to
the coal owner) and reserve properties will be
reported by the coal owner.

Section 11.05(a)

11.05. Valuation of Producing and Reserve Oil and
Natural Gas Properties.

(a) General. -- Oil and/or natural gas is one of the several estates in real property which may be owned either as a separate interest or in conjunction with other interests, usually as fee ownership, oil and/or natural gas ownership or as mineral ownership. If oil and/or natural gas is owned as a separate estate, West Virginia property tax law requires such ownership to be listed, valued and taxed based on its true and actual value. If the interest in oil and/or natural gas is part of a larger interest in a tract of property, the value of the oil and/or natural gas interest shall be included in the value of the larger interest. Oil and/or natural gas may be owned without being produced. Oil and/or natural gas rights may exist where no oil and/or natural gas is actually present, or where the oil and/or natural gas is unproducible or depleted.

(b) (See section 11:05(d)(18) (Page 30) of these rules)
Annual Reports.///The/Tax/Commissioner/will/publish/an
annual/report/for/the/variables/to/be/considered/in/arriving
at/the/value/of/the/specific/oil-related/property.///These
reports/when/required/by/the/regulation/will/be/published,
subjected/to/comment/and/take/effect/upon/the/schedule/set

out/in this section. All such reports must be published on or before the 30th day of April preceding the assessment date, followed by a thirty day period for written public comment. The Tax Commissioner will review the comments and present the final values of the variables to be used in the assessment year on or before July 1 of each calendar year. These final values will be posted in the county assessors office and the State Register.

(b) Categories for Valuing Oil and/or Natural Gas Bearing

Properties. -- Parcels of property thought to bear oil and/or natural gas or having the oil and/or natural gas mineral interest separated from the fee of the property will be classified as oil producing property, assigned oil reserves or unassigned oil reserves, leased, non-producing property, or non-leased, non-producing property.

(c) Definitions.

(1) "Natural gas producing property" means the property from which natural gas is/being has been produced or extracted at any time during the most recent assessment year. Natural gas producing property includes the interest or interests underlying an area of 125 acres of surface per well with active wells on the parcel. Also to be included on natural gas producing property is the parcel acreage above

125 acres per well, to be valued at a specific rate per acre as determined by the Tax Department.

(2) "Oil producing property" means property from which oil ~~is/being~~ has been produced or extracted at any time during the most recent assessment year.

Oil producing property includes the interest or interests underlying an area of up to 40 acres of surface per well with one or more active well(s) on the parcel. Also to be included on oil producing property is the parcel acreage above the 40 acres per well, to be valued at a specific rate per acre as determined by the Tax Department.

(2) // "Assigned/oil/reserve/property" means/properties in/an/area/of/potential/production,/as/determined/by the/Tax/Department,/but/from/which/there/has/been/no past/production/of/oil,/or/the/part/of/a/parcel/from which/there/has/been/past/or/current/production/that lies/outside/an/oil/producing/property//or/the/40 acres/of/surface/per/well/of/oil/producing/property if/the/well/is/shut-in/for/the/entire/year/

(3) "Oil and/or natural gas leased, non-producing property" means properties that are leased by a lessor to a lessee on July 1 of the current assessment year, but were engaged in no production during the same assessment year period of July 1 through June 30. This category shall also include any

acreage that has been shut-in for the entire year.
This category shall also include any acreage owned
by a company or individual whose primary business
involves the production or leasing of any oil and
gas properties.

\\\"Unassigned/oil/reserve/property\\\" means
properties/outside/of/the/area/of/potential/production/
as/determined/by/the/Tax/Department,/in/which/the
oil/mineral/interest/has/been/conveyed/separately
from/the/rest/of/the/property,/or/the/40/acres/of
surface/per/well/of/oil/producing/property/if/the
well/has/been/plugged/and/abandoned/as/required/by
Article/4,/Chapter/22/of/the/West/Virginia/Code/[WV/
Val/Code/§/22-4-1/et/seq./[1981]]

(4) "Oil and/or natural gas non-leased, non-producing
property" means properties that are not leased on
July 1 of the current assessment year and were not
engaged in production during the same assessment
year period of July 1 through June 30; or the 125
acres of surface per well of natural gas or the 40
acres of surface per well of oil producing properties
if the well has been plugged and abandoned as
required by Article 4, Chapter 22 of the West
Virginia Code [WV Code § 22-4-1 et. seq. (1981)].

(5) "Working interest" means the fractional
interest in oil and/or natural gas production

subject to operating expenses and owned by the leasehold or operator. Owner operated wells are to be valued using the working interest formula.

(6) "Royalty interest" means the fractional interest in oil and/or natural gas production not subject to operating expenses and retained by the oil rights owner or lessor. ~~Overriding/royalty interests/not/incurring/operating/expenses/are treated/entirely/as/royalty/interest/~~

(7) "Overriding royalty" means the fractional interest reserved or purchased by a seller of a lease to another party, thereby participating in the gross proceeds of production from the lease while at the same time incurring no operating expenses. Such overriding royalty interests will be appraised using the royalty interest formula, but are to be placed on the personal property books of the county in which the well is located.

(8) "Flush production" means the production of oil and/or natural gas from any well on an oil and/or natural gas producing property whose initial production date is two years or less prior to the date of valuation.

(9) "Settled production" means the production of oil and/or natural gas from all wells on a producing

property whose initial production date is more than two years prior to the date of valuation.

(10) "Personal property" used in oil and/or natural gas production means machinery and equipment in and about the well and all other tangible personal property used in producing oil and/or natural gas from the well. It shall not include vehicles or other tangible personal property not permanently used in production.

(11) "Producer/Operator" means any person or persons, corporation, partnership, adventure or other enterprise which proposes to or does locate, drill, manage or abandon any well.

(12) "Storage Wells" means any property used as a reservoir for the storage of natural gas. These properties shall be valued as non-leased, non-producing natural gas property.

Section 11.05(d)

(d) Methods of Valuation.

(1) General. -- For oil producing property, its value shall be determined by (1) a formula which applies a multiplier to the average daily production of the well(s) for working interest and royalty interest property; plus (2) a value attributable to the personal property used in production per well times the number of producing wells on the property for working interest property. For natural gas producing property, its value shall be determined by a formula which applies a multiplier to the quantity of the gross receipts minus the royalties paid for the working interest or a multiplier times the gross royalty receipts for the royalty interest.

Where ownership is split through a lease or royalty arrangement, different multipliers will be used for the working interest and the royalty interest. Each term in this computation is discussed below.

(2) (See section 11.05(d) (3) (Page 8) of these rules) Average Daily Production -- The average daily production of an oil well is its production rate, measured in terms of oil field standard 42 gallon barrels, for the year preceding the annual tax assessment date, divided by the number of full

or/partial/days/of well/production///Partial/days
shall/include/time/allowed/for/oil/to/collect
between/pumpings///Full/or/partial/days/shall/not
include/time/when/well/non-production/results/from
workover//redrilling//or/well/maintenance/

(2) Percentage Interest in Oil and/or Natural Gas.

-- Where the ownership of oil and/or natural gas in place is divided through a lease or other arrangement, the compensation to the owner of the property is derived by designating a percentage of the production to be the royalty payment to the owner. The remainder is the working interest. The Tax Commissioner will annually determine an assumed average working and royalty percentage interest through a review of oil and gas leases from throughout the State.

(3) Average Production Rate. -- Gas - The Tax Commissioner will annually determine and report the production rate of natural gas wells through review of information filed with the West Virginia Department of Mines Energy, Office of Oil and Gas, and data provided by companies and individuals. The production
rate will be used in the method described in the regulations for the determination of the formulas to be used to appraise natural gas producing properties.

Oil - The average daily production of an oil well is its production rate, measured in terms of

oil field standard 42 gallon barrels, for the year preceding the annual tax assessment date, divided by the number of full or partial days of well production. Partial days shall include time allowed for oil to collect between pumpings. Full or partial days shall not include time when well non-production results from workover, redrilling, or well maintenance.

(4) Average Industry Market Price. -- Oil - The Tax Commissioner will annually derive the average industry market price by reviewing the price paid per barrel by the major West Virginia crude oil purchasers. The Tax Commissioner's annual report on the average industry market price should reflect a reduction for Average Federal Windfall Profits Tax and West Virginia ~~Business and Occupation~~ Severance Taxes deemed to be paid by the working or royalty interests in the production. The average industry market price will be used in the method described in the regulations for determination of the formulas to be used to appraise oil producing properties.

Gas - The Tax Commissioner will annually derive and report the average industry market price by reviewing the price paid per MCF by the major West Virginia natural gas purchasers, a survey of oil and gas associations, and Department of Energy statistical

data. The average industry market price will be used in the method described in the regulations for determination of the formulas to be used to appraise natural gas producing properties.

(5) Average Industry Operating Expense. -- The Tax Commissioner will annually determine the average industry operating expense per well ~~and publish that expense in an annual report.~~ The average industry operating expenses per well will be used in the method described in the regulations for determination of the formulas to be used to appraise ~~oil~~ producing properties.

(6) Average Industry Production Decline Rate. -- The Tax Commissioner will annually derive and report the average industry production decline rate by a review of well production records located at the West Virginia Department of Mines Energy, Office of Oil and Gas and data provided by companies and individuals. ~~The Tax Commissioner will annually publish a report on the result of this review. The average production decline rate will be used in conjunction with the deemed average daily production rate for calculation of multipliers for the various production classifications.~~ The average industry production decline rate will be used in the method described in the regulations for determination of

the formulas to be used to appraise producing properties.

(7) Capitalization Rate. -- A capitalization rate will be developed considering the three components set out in section 11.05(d)(7)(B) of these rules. This rate will be used to select the factor(s) from a standard mid-year life present worth of one table using a compound interest premise. (See section 11.05(d)(10) of these rules for an example.) Below is a listing of terms and definitions employed in developing this capitalization rate.

(A) Definitions.

(i) Bands of Investment Discount Component. -- A discount rate derived by assigning rates to various debt and equity investment financing tiers and summing these rates, weighted by their respective percentages of total financing.

(ii) Discount Component. -- A rate reflecting a provision for returning to an investor a sum of money equal to the aggregate of the anticipated return-on-investment over the economic life of an investment.

(iii) Management Rate. -- A rate reflecting a return to an investor for

the management of similar investment portfolios.

(iv) Market Comparison Discount. -- A discount rate derived by dividing income net of the recapture component and property taxes by the arms-length selling price of the property.

(v) Non-Liquidity Rate. -- A rate reflecting a return to an investor representing the loss of interest on an investment arising from the time required to sell the investment.

(vi) Property Tax Component. -- A rate reflecting a provision for returning to an investor a sum of money equal to property taxes paid over the economic life of an investment.

(vii) Recapture Component. -- A rate reflecting a provision for returning to an investor a sum of money equal to his investment.

(viii) Risk Rate. -- A rate reflecting a return to an investor necessary to attract capital to an investment containing a possible loss of principal and/or interest.

(ix) Safe Rate. -- A rate reflecting a return to a investor on an investment which has little, if any, livelihood of loss of principal or anticipated return on investment.

(x) Summation Discount Component. -- A discount rate expressed as the aggregate of a safe rate, risk rate, non-liquidity rate, and management rate.

(B) Discussion. -- The capitalization rate will be determined annually by the Tax Commissioner through the use of generally accepted methods for estimating such rates. The rate so developed will consider a declining-terminal income series which is indicative of oil and/or natural gas producing properties. The capitalization rate used to value oil and/or natural gas properties will be developed considering (1) a discount component determined primarily by the summation technique, (2) a recapture component, and (3) a property tax component.

(1) Discount Component.

(i) Summation Technique. -- The summation technique will be given primary consideration in the valuation

of oil and/or natural gas producing property. The summation technique will determine a discount component which will be used to calculate the present value of the future income of the oil and/or natural gas producing property utilizing the following four (4) major sub-components:

- (1) Safe Rate
- (2) Risk Rate
- (3) Non-liquidity Rate
- (4) Management Rate

The "Safe Rate" will be developed through review of quarterly interest rates offered on thirteen (13) week United States Treasury Bills for a period of one (1) year prior to the appraisal date. The "Risk Rate" will be developed through review of data resulting from an annual survey of lending institutions, such survey reflecting interest rates required on loans for acquisition and/or development of natural gas producing properties. This survey will be conducted for a ~~three (3)~~ one (1) year

period prior to the appraisal date. Results of the survey will be compared to quarterly interest rates offered on thirteen (13) week United States Treasury Bills for the same ~~three~~ one (1) year period. An interest differential will then be selected representing the "Risk Rate." The "Non-liquidity Rate" will be developed through an annual survey to determine a reasonable estimate of time that natural gas properties remain on the market before being sold. The market time thus determined will be used to identify United States Treasury Bills with similar time differentials in excess of thirteen (13) week Treasury Bills. The interest differential between these securities will be deemed to be representative of the "Non-liquidity Rate." The "Management Rate" will be developed through a survey of investment firms to identify charges for the management of investment portfolios.

(ii) Bands-of-Investment/Market Comparison. -- Data permitting the bands-of-investment technique and market comparison techniques will be used to verify the summation discount component.

(2) Recapture Component -- Selection of a multiplier will be accomplished through access of a standard mid-year life present worth of one table premised on a compound interest rate. This table has a factor for recapture built into the table coefficients. Inclusion of a recapture component in the capitalization rate is therefore not appropriate.

(3) Property Tax Component -- This component will be derived by multiplying the assessment rate by the statewide average of tax rates on Class III property.

Page 10
/ (8) Multipliers -- Oil -- The multiplier serves to combine mathematically the effects of the deemed average daily production rate, average industry market price of oil, average industry well operating expense, working and royalty interest, flush and settled production, average production decline rate and a capitalization rate. [See section 11.05(d)(10) of these rules] This multiplier will not be constant

for all oil producing properties. Each category defined below will have a separate multiplier and the procedure and results of these income analyses will be published in an annual report by the Tax Commissioner. The multipliers are to be used for oil producing properties.

Separate multipliers shall be derived for each of the following twelve (12) categories:

(A) Working interest in settled production for average daily production between 0 and .750 barrels per day of oil.

(B) Working interest in settled production for average daily production of between .751 and 2.000 barrels per day.

(C) Working interest in settled production for average daily production of more than 2.000 barrels per day.

(D) Working interest in flush production for average daily production of between 0 and .750 barrels per day.

(E) Working in flush production for average daily production of between .751 and 2.000 barrels per day.

(F) Working interest in flush production for average daily production of over 2.000 barrels per day.

(G) Royalty interest in settled production for average daily production between 0 and .750 barrels per day.

(H) Royalty interest in settled production for average daily production between .751 and 2.000 barrels per day.

(I) Royalty interest in settled production for average daily production in excess of 2.000 barrels per day.

(J) Royalty interest in flush production for average daily production between 0 and .750 barrels per day.

(K) Royalty interest in flush production of average daily production of between .751 and 2.000 barrels per day.

(L) Royalty interest in flush production for average daily production of 2.000 barrels per day.

(9) Deemed Average Daily Production Rate. -- For the purpose of determining multipliers for wells of different productive capacities, wells will be divided into three classifications. Those classifications will be:

(a) 0 through .750 barrels of average daily production.

(b) .751 through 2.000 barrels of average daily production.

(c) Greater than 2.000 barrels of average daily production.

For the sole purpose of calculating the multiplier applicable to each classification of production, all wells within each classification will be deemed to have the same rate of production and those rates are as follows:

	<u>Classification</u>	<u>Deemed ADP Rate</u>
(a)	0 - .750 ADP	.750 ADP
(b)	.751 - 2.000 ADP	1.500 ADP
(c)	2.000+	4.000 ADP
(10)	<u>EXAMPLE:</u>	

The multipliers for each category will be determined as shown in this example. The numbers used in this example are not the result of any actual survey, although they may approximate or duplicate the results of such surveys. This example assumes that the necessary annual surveys have been performed with the results as follows:

Average Daily Production (ADP) Rate = .75 barrel

Working Interest = 7/8 of production

Royalty Interest = 1/8 of production

Average Industry Market Price = \$22.50/barrel

Average Industry Operating Expense - \$3,600/year

Royalty Interest

0-.750 ADP Category

Deemed Average Daily Production (ADP)	Royalty Interest ADP	Income	Capitalization Rate Present Worth of 1 Factor	Discounted Income
Year 1 Year 2 Year 3 Year 4 Year 5 Year 6	.750 .698 .649 .604 .562 .523	.094 .086 .081 .076 .070 .065	\$772 714 665 624 575 534	.933 .811 .705 .613 .533 .464
				\$ 720 579 469 383 306 248

Total Discounted Income \$2,705

$$\begin{aligned} &\$2,705 \text{ (Total Discounted Income)} \\ &= \$28,777 \text{ (Multiplier for Royalty Interest)} \end{aligned}$$

.094 (Year 1: Royalty Interest ADP)

Working Interest

0-.750 ADP Category

Year	Annual Gross Income	Operating Expenses	Net Income	Capitalization Rate Present Worth of 1 Factor	Discounted Net Income
Year 1	\$5,388	\$3,600	\$1,788	.933	\$1,668
Year 2	5,018	3,600	1,418	.811	1,150
Year 3	4,665	3,600	1,065	.705	751
Year 4	4,345	3,600	745	.613	457
Year 5	4,041	3,600	441	.533	235
Year 6	3,762	3,600	162	.464	75

\$4,336

Total Discounted
Net Income

$$\begin{aligned} &\$4,336 \text{ (Total Discounted Net Income)} \\ &= \$6,610 \text{ (Multiplier for Working Interest)} \end{aligned}$$

.656 (Year 1: Working Interest ADP)

ALL Personal Property Used in Oil Production --
 The Tax Commissioner will annually derive and
 publish a report of the average value of the personal
 property used in oil production. The Tax Commissioner
 will review the comments on the report and present
 the value for the personal property used in oil
 production. This value will be multiplied by the
 number of producing and shut-in wells on the property
 to determine the overall value of personal property
 used in oil production.

(11) Summary of Valuing Oil Producing Property. --

Each active oil property in West Virginia will be
 valued in the following way:

Working Interest

1. (Working Interest
 Average Daily X (Multiplier) = (Value of Oil
 Production) Producing
 Property)

PLUS

2. (Value for Personal Property Used in Oil Production) X (Number of Wells) = Total Value of
 Personal Property
 Used in Oil Production

Royalty Interest

1. (Royalty Interest
 Average Daily X (Multiplier) = (Value of Oil
 Production) Producing Property
 Production)

PLUS

2. (Excess Acreage
 Above 40 Acres X (Rate per Acre) = (Value of Excess
 Per Well) Oil Acreage)

(12) Multipliers -- Gas - The multiplier combines mathematically the effects of average industry market price of natural gas, average industry well operating expenses, working and royalty interest, average production rate, average production decline rate, flush and settled production and a capitalization rate. [See section 11.05(d)(13) of these rules] This multiplier will not be constant for all natural gas producing properties. Each category defined below will have a separate multiplier. The multiplier will be derived by conducting an income analysis of a typical West Virginia well based on the aforementioned variables and published in an annual report.

Separate multipliers shall be established by the Tax Commissioner for the following four (4) categories:

- (1) Working interest in settled production.
- (2) Working interest in flush production.
- (3) Royalty interest in settled production.
- (4) Royalty interest in flush production.

(13) Example:

The income analysis chart will be in the following forms. The figures used in these charts are hypothetical values of what may be derived from the annual reports and are not to be considered actual figures, although they may approximate or duplicate the results of actual annual reports.

		<u>Working Interest</u>		<u>Capitalization</u>		<u>Discounted</u> <u>Net Income</u>
		<u>Operating</u> <u>Expenses</u>	<u>Net</u> <u>Income</u>	<u>Rate Present</u> <u>Worth of 1 Factor</u>		
Year 1	6,000	\$3,000	\$10,650	.933	\$ 9,936	
Year 2	5,580	3,000	9,696	.811	7,863	
Year 3	5,189	3,000	8,804	.705	6,207	
Year 4	4,826	3,000	7,980	.613	4,892	
Year 5	4,488	3,000	7,210	.533	3,843	
Year 6	4,174	3,000	6,495	.464	3,014	
Year 7	3,882	3,000	5,832	.403	2,350	
Year 8	3,610	3,000	5,213	.351	1,830	
Year 9	3,357	3,000	4,636	.305	1,414	
Year 10	3,122	3,000	4,103	.265	1,087	
Year 11	2,903	3,000	3,604	.231	833	
Year 12	2,700	3,000	3,144	.200	629	
Year 13	2,511	3,000	2,712	.174	472	
Year 14	2,335	3,000	2,312	.152	351	
Year 15	2,172	3,000	1,943	.132	256	
Year 16	2,020	3,000	1,597	.115	184	
Year 17	1,879	3,000	1,274	.100	127	
Year 18	1,747	3,000	975	.087	85	
Year 19	1,625	3,000		.075	52	
Year 20	1,511	3,000		.066	29	
Year 21	1,405	3,000		.057	11	
Year 22	1,309	3,000		.075	0	
					\$45,465	

Table D

Total Discounted
Net Income

\$45,465 (Total Discounted Income)
\$13,650 (Year 1: Working Interest Production) = 3.331 multiplier for Working Interest)

Table D

	<u>Total Production</u>	<u>Royalty Interest Production</u>	<u>Royalty Interest Income</u>	<u>Capitalization Rate Present Worth of 1 Factor</u>	<u>Discounted Income</u>
Year 1	6,000	750	\$1,950	.933	\$ 1,819
Year 2	5,580	697	1,812	.811	1,470
Year 3	5,189	649	1,687	.705	1,189
Year 4	4,826	603	1,568	.613	961
Year 5	4,488	561	1,459	.533	778
Year 6	4,174	522	1,357	.464	630
Year 7	3,882	485	1,261	.403	508
Year 8	3,610	451	1,173	.351	412
Year 9	3,357	420	1,092	.305	333
Year 10	3,122	390	1,014	.265	269
Year 11	2,903	363	944	.231	218
Year 12	2,700	337	876	.200	175
Year 13	2,511	314	816	.174	142
Year 14	2,335	292	759	.152	115
Year 15	2,172	271	705	.132	93
Year 16	2,020	252	655	.115	75
Year 17	1,879	235	611	.100	61
Year 18	1,747	218	567	.087	49
Year 19	1,625	203	529	.075	40
Year 20	1,511	189	490	.066	32
Year 21	1,405	176	461	.057	26
Year 22	1,309				0
					\$ 9,395

Table B

Total Discounted
Income

$$\begin{aligned}
 & \$9,395 \text{ (Total Discounted Income)} \\
 & \$1,950 \text{ (Year 1: Royalty Interest Production,} \\
 & \quad = 4.818 \text{ (Multiplier for Royalty Interest)}
 \end{aligned}$$

(14) Summary of Method for Valuing Active Natural Gas Producing Property. -- Each active natural gas well in West Virginia will be valued in the following way:

Working Interest

1. (Gross Receipts
Less Royalties) X (Multiplier) = (Working Interest
Value of Natural Gas
Producing Property)

PLUS

2. (Value for Personal Property Used in Oil Production) X (Number of Wells / Total Value of Personal Property Used in Oil Production)

Royalty Interest

1. (Royalties) X (Multiplier) = (Royalty Interest
Value of Natural Gas
Production)

PLUS

2. (Excess Acreage
Above 125 Acres
Per Well) X (Rate per Acre) = (Value of Excess
Gas Acreage)

(g) Valuation of Assigned Reserves. -- The value per acre of assigned reserves shall be equal to the annual lease payment per acre times the multiplier. A valuation schedule for assigned oil reserve properties will be determined annually by the Tax Commissioner on a regional basis. The Tax Commissioner will annually conduct a review of oil agreements transacted at arms length in all fifty-five counties to determine the annual lease payment per acre as

well/as/the/lease/term///The/Tax/Commissioner/will
also/conduct/a/review/of/non-dry/completions/in/all
55/counties/as/reported/to/the/West/Virginia/Department
of/Mines//Office/of/Oil/and/Gas///The/assigned
reserve/multiplier/is/the/sum/of/the/projected
annual/income/stream/during/the/lease/term/discounted
in/each/year/by/a/capitalization/rate///The/regions/
the/annual/lease/payment/per/acre//lease/term//and
multiplier/will/be/published/annually/in/a/report/by
the/Tax/Commissioner///The/Tax/Commissioner/will
review/the/public/comments/on/the/report/and/present
the/valuation/determination/for/assigned/oil/reserve
property/

(15) Valuation of Leased, Non-Producing Acreage. --

The value per acre of leased, non-producing acreage shall equal the annual lease payment per acre times the multiplier.

A valuation schedule for leased, non-producing properties will be determined annually by the Tax Commissioner on a county-by-county basis. The Tax Commissioner will annually conduct a review of oil and/or natural gas agreements transacted at arms length in all fifty-five counties to determine the annual lease payment per acre, as well as the lease term. The multiplier is the sum of the projected annual income stream during the lease term discounted

in each year by a capitalization rate. The annual lease payment per acre, lease term, and multiplier will be published annually in a report by the Tax Commissioner and will be used to determine the values for leased, non-producing property.

(15) Valuation of Unassigned Oil Reserves. -- Unassigned Reserves will be valued at the nominal rate of \$1.00 per acre. Unassigned reserves will be properties outside of the area of potential production as determined by the Tax Commissioner. The Tax Commissioner will annually publish a report of the regions which are classified as unassigned oil reserves.

(16) Valuation of Non-Leased, Non-Producing Acreage. -- Non-leased, non-producing acreage will be valued at the nominal rate of \$1.00 per acre, but in no instance will any oil and/or natural gas property be valued under \$100. This category also includes any plugged and abandoned acreage - 125 acres per gas well, 40 acres per oil well.

(17) Valuation of Wells that Produce Both Oil and Gas. -- The valuation of these producing wells shall be determined by use of the methods described in § 11.03 herein for oil and § 11.06 for natural gas, excluding the value for personal property used in

both methods. These values, including the value of personal property, shall then be summed to result in the overall value of the oil and/or natural gas producing acreage.

The Tax Commissioner will annually derive and publish a report of the average value of the personal property used in oil and gas production. This value will be multiplied by the number of producing and shut-in wells on the property to determine the overall value of personal property used in oil and/or natural gas production.

(18) Annual Reports. -- The Tax Commissioner will publish an annual report for the variables to be considered in arriving at the value of the specific oil and/or natural gas related property. This report will be filed with the office of the Secretary of State on or before July 1 May 31st of each year, followed by a 15 day period for written public comment. The Tax Commissioner will review the comments and present final variables and multipliers to be used on or before July 1.

(19) Active Farm Properties -- The oil and gas rights, that are part of a "fee" estate where the use of the surface has qualified as an active farm, will be valued in the following manner:

(A) Where income or royalty is not derived from the oil and gas rights the oil and gas interest shall not be valued.

(B) Where income or royalty is derived from the oil and gas rights the oil and gas interest shall be valued as follows:

(1) Fee estates where the annual wholesale value of farm commodities or products, is fifty percent (50%) or more of the usual annual gross income from all uses of the property, shall be subject to farm use valuation. Thus oil and gas interests shall not be valued under this situation.

(2) Fee estates where the annual wholesale value of farm commodities or products is less than fifty percent (50%) of the usual annual gross income from all uses of the property, the applicable oil and gas values shall be added to the surface farm use value.

(20) Property Reports -- Prior to November 1 of each year the producer and oil and gas owner will be required to file a report with the assessor of the county where the oil and gas property is assessed. These reports will be

designed by the State Tax Commissioner so that
information pertinent to the valuation of such
producing property, leased non-producing
property, and non-leased non-producing property
will be reported by the oil and gas producer,
lessee, and owner.

FILED

JUN 13 1963

11.08. Valuation of Other Active Natural Resources

(a) General.

(1) Other active natural resource interests, such as limestone, fireclay, dolomite, sandstone, shale, sand and gravel, and salt are some of the several estates in real property which may be owned either as a separate interest, or in conjunction with other interests, usually as fee ownership or as minerals ownership. If the other active natural resource interest is owned as a separate estate, either absolute or as a leasehold interest, West Virginia property tax law requires such ownership to be listed, valued and taxed based on its true and actual value.

(2) Other West Virginia natural resource interests, such as lead and zinc, manganese, iron ore, radioactive minerals, and oil shale, which at present are not being actively mined shall be valued in accordance with this regulation, when such interests are separated from the fee interest or begin being leased or actively mined.

(3) These other natural resource interests may be owned without being mined. These other natural resources rights may exist where the natural resource is not actually present, or where the natural resource is unmineable or mined out.

(2) Active Mining Property. -- This term refers to the mineable ~~and/merchandise~~ natural resource on a parcel involved in a mining operation. For the purposes of determining active mining property, all contiguous parcels, under/one regardless of ownership, or/owned/or/leased/by/interrelated businesses/or/individuals/shall/be/treated/as/one parcel that are under lease or involved in the permitted operation shall be treated as an active mining parcel. The active mining acreage of any natural resource or resources on a parcel shall be calculated by multiplying acres mined times the determined life of the mine. If this calculation, however, results in an acreage figure that is higher than the total mineable acreage of that natural resource on that parcel, the lower figure shall be used. This calculation shall be made of each "other natural resource" activity being mined on the parcel.

For use in these regulations, the maximum active mining property for each natural resource will be as follows:

(A) Surface Limestone. -- The active mining property of a surface limestone mine shall be derived by multiplying ~~ten/100~~ five (5) years times acres mined.

(B) Deep Limestone. -- The active mining property of a deep limestone mine shall be derived by multiplying fifteen (15) years times acres mined.

(C) Sandstone. -- The active mining property of a surface sandstone mine shall be derived by multiplying ~~ten (10)~~ five (5) years times acres mined.

(D) Surface Clay and Shale. -- The active mining property of a surface clay and shale mine shall be derived by multiplying ~~ten (10)~~ five (5) years times acres mined.

(E) Deep Clay and Shale. -- The active mining property of a deep clay and shale mine shall be derived by multiplying fifteen (15) years times acres mined.

(F) Sand and Gravel. -- The active mining property of a sand and gravel mine shall be derived by multiplying ~~ten (10)~~ five (5) years times acres mined.

(G) Salt. -- The active mining property around each salt well shall be a maximum of 35 acres. After a well's first year of production, active mining property shall be derived by subtracting acres mined from the 35 acres.

(3) Active Reserves. -- This term means and includes the entire residual acreage of the mineable and merchantable natural resource being mined in excess of the active mining property, or the number of acres corresponding to 25 years times the acres mined per year 18/11/08 by 11/11/11, whichever is less.

(4) (3) Average Annual Production. -- The average annual rate of natural resource production, in tons per fiscal year, ending June 30th of each calendar year, is determined by a weighted average of the three (3) years net production, that has occurred between July 1 and June 30 of the most current fiscal years.

The weighted average shall be determined by multiplying the most recent year's production by .4, the previous two (2) years production multiplied by .3, and the resulting three (3) figures added together to arrive at the average annual production. However, if there is no production during the most recent fiscal year then the property will not be valued as active mining property for that year.

Where there has been no production during the second or third most recent fiscal year, the production for the current year will be factored

by .5 and the production for the earlier fiscal year in which production existed will be factored by .5 and the resulting two figures will be added together to arrive at the average annual production.

If there was no production in both the second and third most recent fiscal years then the production for the most recent fiscal year will be factored by 1.0 and the resulting figure will be the average annual production.

(5) Barren. -- This term means and includes those properties where other natural resource rights are separately and/or individually owned, and the existence of any natural resource has not been established.

(6) Capitalization Rate. -- A rate used to convert an estimate of income into an estimate of market value. [For further explanation see section 11.08(c)(1)(H) of these rules]

(7) Inactive Reserves. -- Inactive reserves are those natural resource acres or portions thereof which are mineable and merchantable but are not active mining property or active reserves.

(8) Life of Mining Operation. -- The life of the mining operation (in years) shall be equal to the active mining property acreage divided by

acres mined. The maximum mine life shall be ~~ten~~
(10) five (5) years for surface mines involving
limestone, sandstone, clay and shale, and sand and
gravel, ~~and~~ ten (10) years for wells used in the
production of salt, and fifteen (15) years for
deep mined involving limestone, and clay and
shale. In calculating the years involved in the
life of active mining property, all fractional
figures will be rounded to the nearest whole
number.

(9) //Merchandise/Natural Resource//++//A merchandise
natural resource is one ordinarily extracted for
sale and can usually be sold at a profit, or which
is extracted for use in the manufacture of other
products (e.g., salt for use in making paint and
chemicals).

(10) (7) Mineable Natural Resource. -- A mineable
natural resource is one which could be profitably
mined by judicious methods which is so situated
that it may be mined using generally accepted
mining practices and suitable equipment and which
is of such quality so as to be commercially
saleable (as either a mined natural resource or as
a recoverable reserve).

(11) (8) Mined-Out. -- A natural resource, or any
portion thereof, determined to be depleted by

prior mining operations, and which is not mineable ~~and/merchandise~~ by modern technology.

(12) (9) Mining Operation. -- This term shall mean an enterprise engaged in actively obtaining or preparing to obtain a natural resource or its by-products from the earth's crust, including underground, surface and auger mines. Each mining operation may have more than one area designated as "Active Mining Property" as defined in Section 11.08(b)(2) of these rules. This designation of "Active Mining Property" areas shall be determined as follows:

(i) If the mining operation is producing a natural resource from a Department of Natural Resources or Department of ~~Mines~~ Energy permit, then that operation will be designated an "Active Mining Property." However, if the mining operation is producing from more than one natural resource under a Department of Natural Resources or Department of ~~Mines~~ Energy permit, then each active natural resource will be designated as an "Active Mining Property."

(ii) If the mining operation is producing a natural resource at different locations, portals and/or faces under one specific

Department of Natural Resources or Department of ~~Mines~~ Energy permit, then that operation will be designated as one "Active Mining Property." However, if the production of the natural resource involves different mining techniques (e.g., surface, auger or deep mining method), or if mining sites are separate and generally independent, then such sites will be designated as separate "Active Mining Properties."

(13) (10) Multiplier. -- This term shall mean the "present worth of one per period" for the life of the mining operation employing the capitalization rate determined in section 11.08(c)(1) ~~(C)~~ (H) of these rules, as determined by a standard mid-year life Inwood table.

(11) Recovery Rate. -- This, which is also known as mining height, is the percentage of the natural resource thickness that is economically recovered through the mining process.

(12) Reserves. -- Reserves are those natural resource acres or portions thereof, which are mineable and contain recoverable natural resources but are not active mining property.

(14) (13) Royalty Rate. -- The royalty rates determined annually by the Tax Commissioner are

the current market royalty rates for arms-length, willing-buyer, willing-seller, transactions for each of the different types of natural resources and types of mining operations derived in section 11.08(c)(1) ~~(B)~~ (F) of these rules. The royalty rates are deemed to be paid to each owner of a natural resource estate for all actively mined property.

(14) Thickness. -- This, which is also known as the natural resource or seam height, is the measurement of all the visible natural resource, including any thinner resource strands (splits) seen above or below the main block.

(15) Tons Per Acre Foot. -- This is the outcome of the calculation used in converting a natural resource's specific gravity into a quantity measurement.

~~(13)~~ (16) Unmineable Natural Resource. -- A natural resource which is not mineable and ~~merchandise~~ as defined above.

(c) Valuation Methods.

(1) Method for Determining Value of Active Mining Property.

(A) General. -- The value of active mining property shall be the ~~average/annual/production times/a/royalty/rate~~ value per active acre

times ~~a/multiplier~~ the amount of active acres. In no case will the active mining property be valued at less than its value as ~~inactive~~ reserve property.

(B) Value Per Active Acre. -- The value per active acre is determined through the following formula:

$$\begin{array}{rcl} & \text{Thickness} & \\ \times & \text{Tons per foot acre} & \\ \times & \text{Recovery Rate} & \\ \times & \text{Multiplier} & \\ \div & [\text{Mine Life (yrs.)}] & = \text{Value per Active Acre} \end{array}$$

(C) Thickness (ft.). -- See definition in Section 11.08(b)(14) of these rules.

(D) Tons Per Foot Acre. -- See definition in Section 11.08(b)(15) of these rules, and actual tons per natural resource in Section 11.08(b)(1) of these rules.

(E) Recovery Rate. -- See definition in Section 11.08(b)(11) of these rules.

(F) Royalty Rate. -- For use in the formula prescribed by this regulation, the royalty rate(s) will be determined for each of the different types of natural resources and types of mining operations. These will include specific royalty rates for (1) limestone (dolomite) surface mine; (2) limestone (dolomite) deep mine; (3) sandstone

(industrial) surface mine; (4) sandstone (aggregate) surface mine; (5) clay and shale surface mine; (6) clay and shale deep mine; (7) sand and gravel surface mine; and (8) salt wells. These royalty rates shall be established annually by the Tax Commissioner after review of recorded, willing seller-willing buyer arms-length natural resource property leases that have occurred in the State of West Virginia during at least the ~~eight~~ five (5) years ~~WV Code § 11-1A-3~~ prior to appraisal date, and through inspection of other appropriate information. This review will place a greater emphasis on the information and leases transacted during the most recent years. For those natural resources that are not involved in any recorded lease agreements, the Tax Commissioner will derive a royalty rate through surveys conducted with private appraisal and/or engineering companies, data provided by the West Virginia Geological and Economic Survey, West Virginia Department of Natural Resources, West Virginia Department of ~~Mines~~ Energy, West Virginia Department of Highways, and other appropriate information from the specific natural resource companies

involved. The Tax Commissioner will maintain and publish this survey (report) of royalty rates (which will include the preliminary rates) on or before ~~March~~ May 31 of each year; will accept written public comment on the survey until ~~May~~ June 15 of each year; and issue final royalty rates on or before July 1 of each year. This survey of royalty rates will be constructed to indicate the following: (1) county in which leased property is located; (2) deed book, page number; (3) lessor-lessee; (4) date recorded; (5) acreage involved; (6) type of mining operation; (7) consideration; and (8) a narrative on rates derived for those non-leased natural resources. From this survey, the Tax Commissioner will select the royalty rate(s) that best typify such transactions. In order to convert percentage royalty rates into specific value per ton rates, the Tax Commissioner will conduct a review of the specific natural resource selling prices in West Virginia by requesting such information from private purchasers, State Department of Highways, and West Virginia Geological and Economic Survey, as well as other informative

sources available and select specific selling price rate(s) based on prices best typifying activity in each appraisal year. The selected selling prices per ton when multiplied by the percentage royalty rate will result in a price per ton royalty rate factor.

(G) Amount of Active Acres. -- The maximum amount of active acres are described in Section 11.08(b)(2) of these rules.

(H) Capitalization Rate. -- This capitalization rate will be developed considering the techniques found in general practice in the appraisal profession when developing an income approach valuation estimate. Below is a listing of terms and definitions employed in developing various capitalization rate indicators.

(1) Definitions.

(i) Bands of Investment Discount Component. -- A discount rate derived by assigning rates to various debt and equity investment financing tiers and summing these rates, weighted by their respective percentages of total financing.

(ii) Discount Component. -- A rate reflecting a provision for returning to an investor a sum of money equal to the aggregate of the anticipated return-on-investment over the economic life of an investment.

(iii) Economic Life Method of Recapture. -- A method of developing a recapture rate by estimating the period of time an investment will produce a return and estimating an equal periodic rate of recapture of the investment over this return period.

(iv) Management Rate. -- A rate reflecting a return to an investor for the management of similar investment portfolios.

(v) Market Comparison Discount. -- A discount rate derived by dividing income net of the recapture component and property taxes by the arms-length selling price of the property.

(vi) Market Comparison Method of Recapture. -- A recapture rate estimated by dividing income net of the discount component and property taxes by the arms-length selling price of the property.

(vii) Non-Liquidity Rate. -- A rate reflecting a return to an investor representing the loss of interest on an investment arising from the time required to sell the investment.

(viii) Property Tax Component. -- A rate reflecting a provision for returning to an investor a sum of money equal to property taxes paid over the economic life of an investment.

(ix) Recapture Component. -- A rate reflecting a provision for returning to an investor a sum of money equal to his investment.

(x) Risk Rate. -- A rate reflecting a return to an investor necessary to attract capital to an

investment containing a possible loss of principal and/or interest.

(xi) Safe Rate. -- A rate reflecting a return to an investor on an investment which has little, if any, livelihood of loss of principal or anticipated return on investment.

(xii) Summation Discount Component. -- A discount rate expressed as the aggregate of a safe rate, risk rate, non-liquidity rate, and management rate.

(2) Discussion. -- The capitalization rate as defined in section 11.08(b) (6) (5) of these rules will be determined annually by the Tax Commissioner through the use of generally accepted methods for estimating such rates. The rate so developed will consider a level-terminal income series which is indicative of active mining properties. The capitalization rate used to value active mining properties will be developed giving consideration to the following three (3) approaches:

(a) Discount Component

(i) Market Comparison. --

Sufficient sales data permitting, the market comparison technique will be employed as the primary indicator for an appropriate discount component. The market comparison discount component will be developed by dividing aggregate royalty rate income streams adjusted for recapture by verified recorded arms-length sales transactions for active mining properties which have occurred in the State of West Virginia during the ~~eight~~ five (5) years ~~ending~~ ending prior to the annual appraisal date. The market comparison discount component selected will be based upon those rate indicators best typifying activity in this ~~eight~~ five (5) year research period. In selecting the discount

component greater emphasis will be given to information from arms-length sales occurring during the most recent years of the study.

(ii) Summation Technique. --

In the absence of sufficient data to statistically support primary consideration of the market comparison technique, the summation techniques will be given primary consideration. The summation discount component will be developed reflecting the following four (4) major sub-components:

- (1) Safe Rate
- (2) Risk Rate
- (3) Non-Liquidity Rate
- (4) Management Rate

The "Safe Rate" will be developed through review of quarterly interest rates offered on thirteen (13) week United States Treasury Bills for a period of three (3)

years prior to the appraisal date. The "Risk Rate" Will be developed through review of data resulting from an annual survey of lending institutions, such survey reflecting interest rates required on loans for acquisition and/or development of natural resource properties. This survey will be conducted for a three (3) year period prior to the appraisal date. Results of the survey will be compared to quarterly interest rates offered on thirteen (13) week United States Treasury Bills for the same three (3) year period. An interest differential will then be selected representing the "Risk Rate." The "Non-Liquidity Rate" will be developed through an annual survey to determine a reasonable estimate of time that natural resource properties remain on the market before

being sold. The market time thus determined will be used to identify United States Treasury Bills with similar time differentials in excess of thirteen (13) week Treasury Bills. The interest differential between these securities will be deemed to be representative of the "Non-Liquidity Rate." The "Management Rate" will be developed through a survey of investment firms to identify charges for the management of investment portfolios.

(iii) Bands-of-Investment. -- Data permitting the Bands-of-Investment technique will be considered in conjunction with the two (2) previously mentioned discount estimate components.

(b) Recapture Component. -- Selection of a multiplier will be accomplished through access of a

standard mid-year life Inwood table. The Inwood table has a factor for recapture built into the table coefficients. Inclusion of a recapture component in the capitalization rate is therefore not appropriate.

(c) Property Tax Component. -- The effective property tax rate will be estimated by multiplying the assessment ratio by the average statewide levy rate for Class III property. At the present time, research indicates that the natural resource property tax is paid by the property owner with no additional compensation from the producer. Thus, since property taxes are part of Royalty Rates, this component will be used in the capitalization rate. However, if this described general practice changes, (property taxes paid by producer) then the use of this component will be deleted.

(3) The surveys referenced in Section 11.08(c)(1)(C) (H)(2) of these rules will be conducted and tentative results published by the Tax Commissioner on or before March May 31 of each year.

Public comment on such surveys will be accepted until May/1 June 15 of each year, and final results will be issued on or before July 1 of each year.

(2) // Valuation of Active Reserves.

(A) // General // ++ The value of each acre of active reserves shall be one-tenth of the per acre value of active mining property.

(B) // Per Acre Value of Active Mining Property // ++ Per acre value of active mining property equals the value of active mining property as described in S 11.08(C)(1) divided by the number of acres in the active mining property.

(C) // In the event that the active reserve value per acre is less than the inactive reserve value per acre, the inactive reserve value per acre will be used.

(3) (2) Valuation of Inactive Reserves. --

Inactive Reserve values for limestone, sandstone, clay and shale, sand and gravel, and salt shall be determined annually by the Tax Commissioner. This

determination will be conducted by the Tax Commissioner after review of recorded willing seller-willing buyer arms-length natural resource property sales that have occurred in the State of West Virginia during at least the ~~eight~~ five (5) years ~~(W/Va/CODE/§/11-1A-3)~~ prior to the appraisal date, and through inspection of other appropriate information. This review will place a greater emphasis on the information and sales transacted during the most recent years. For those natural resource properties which are not involved in any recorded sale agreements, the Tax Commissioner will may also derive the valuations through ~~surveys~~ reviews conducted with private appraisal and/or engineering companies, data provided by the West Virginia Geological and Economic Survey, West Virginia Department of Natural Resources, West Virginia Department of ~~Mines~~ Energy and the West Virginia Department of Highways, and other appropriate information as requested from the natural resource owners or producers. The Tax Commissioner will maintain and publish this survey (report) of ~~inactive~~ natural resource property sales on or before ~~March~~ May 31 of each year; will accept written public comment on the survey until May 1 of each year; and issue the final values per acre

on or before ~~July 1~~ June 15 of each year. This survey of ~~inactive~~ reserve natural resource sales will be constructed to indicate the following: (1) county in which the property is located; (2) deed book, page number; (3) grantor-grantee; (4) date recorded; (5) acreage involved; (6) natural resource involved; (7) consideration; (8) consideration per natural resource acre sold and (9) a narrative on values derived for those natural resources not involved in sales. From this survey, the Tax Commissioner will select the values per acre for each natural resource that best typify such transactions.

Also/as/part/of/this/review//the/Tax/Commissioner/will/consider/the/effect/of/inactive/mining/properties/being/adjacent/to/active/mining/properties/and/active/reserves/in/determining/values/under/this/section/

(3) Valuation of Unmineable Other Natural Resource Properties. -- Properties in this category shall be valued at \$1.00 per acre.

(4) Valuation of Mined-Out/~~Unmineable~~/Barren Other Natural Resource Properties. -- Properties in this category shall be valued at \$1.00 per ~~surface~~ acre.

(5) Total Natural Resource Valuation. -- The
total natural resource valuation for any natural
resource parcel will involve the value for all
active acres, all reserve acres, all unmineable,
and all mined out/barren acreage. However, the
total value for any natural resource parcel shall
not be less than \$100.00.

(3) (6) Summary of Valuation of Methods.

Table 5 - Valuation of Other Natural Resources

(A) Properties with/mineable/merchantable
that involve natural resources shall be
values as follows:

Active/Mining/Acres

(Average/Annual//////////Royalty//////////Active/Natural
 /Natural/Resource////X///Rate////X///Multiplier//#/Resource/Real
 /Production/In/TonsY//////Per/TonY//////////Property/ValueY

Active/Reserve/Acres/(Part/of/Active/Operation)

(Total//////////Per/Acre/Value//////////Active/Reserve
 /Active/Reserve////X///of/Active/Mine//X///10%//#/Other/Natural
 /AcresY//////////Ing/PropertyY//////////Resource/Real
 ////////////////PropertyY

Inactive/Reserve/Acres/(Leased/or/Permitted/Acres/+/No/Mining)

(Total/Inactive//////////Inactive/Reserve//////////Inactive/Reserve
 /Reserve/AcresY////X///Value/Per/AcreY//////////#/Other/Natural
 ////////////////Resource/Real
 ////////////////Property/ValueY

Active Mining Property

$$\text{Value per Active Acre} \times \text{Active Acres} = \frac{\text{Active Natural Resource Real Property Value}}$$

Reserve Property

$$\frac{\text{Per Acre Reserve Value}}{\text{Reserve Acres}} \times \text{Reserve Acres} = \text{Reserve Real Property Value}$$

Unmineable Property

$$\text{\$1 per acre} \times \text{Unmineable Acres} = \text{Unmineable Real Property Value}$$

Mined Out/Barren Property

$$\text{\$1 per acre} \times \frac{\text{Mined Out/Barren Acres}}{\text{Acres}} = \text{Mined Out/Barren Real Property Value}$$

(B) // Mined-out, unmineable and barren natural resource properties shall be valued at one dollar (\\$1.00) per surface acre.

(C) (B) The total value for the natural resource properties will be the sum of the value of the active mining property, active reserves, the inactive reserves and the mined-out/unmineable/barren acres.

(D) (C) If other real property interest are owned in the natural resource acreage, then the value of those additional interests shall be added to the total value of the natural resource properties to arrive at the total real property value.

(6Y) (7) Leasehold Interests. -- These regulations generally attribute the value of the natural resource to the owner of the value of the natural resource to the owner of the natural resource property. In those circumstances, however, where the owner of the property is subject to a lease requiring the owner to permit mining at royalty rates substantially below current market values, the owner may petition the assessor, and on appeal, the Tax Commissioner, to attribute a portion of the value of the coal determined by this formula to the leaseholder.

(8) Active Farm Properties. -- The natural resource rights, that are part of a "fee" estate where the use of the surface has qualified as an active farm, will be valued in the following manner:

(A) Where income or royalty is not derived from the natural resource rights (natural resource rights not leased or non-producing) the natural resource interest shall not be valued.

(B) Where income or royalty is derived from the natural resource rights (natural resource rights leased or producing) the natural

resource interest shall be valued as follows:

(1) Fee estates where the annual wholesale value of farm commodities or products, is fifty percent (50%) or more of the usual annual gross income from all uses of the property, shall be subject to farm use valuation. Thus, natural resource interests shall not be valued under this situation.

(2) Fee estates where the annual wholesale value of farm commodities or products is less than fifty percent (50%) of the usual annual gross income from all uses of the property, the applicable natural resource values shall be added to the surface farm use value.

(9) Property Reports. -- Prior to November 1 of each year the producer and natural resource owner will be required to file a report with the assessor of the county where the natural resource property is assessed. These reports will be designed by the State Tax Commissioner so that producing properties will be reported by the producer (with authorization from natural resource owner).



CORRECTED VERSION

WEST VIRGINIA LEGISLATURE
LEGISLATIVE RULE-MAKING REVIEW COMMITTEE
Room M-438, State Capitol
Charleston, West Virginia 25305
(304) 340-3286

1987 DEC 16

Senator Larry A. Tucker, Co-Chairman
Delegate Thomas A. Knight, Co-Chairman

December 9, 1987

M. E. Mawery, Counsel
Debra A. Graham, Associate Counsel
Marie Nickerson, Receiving Clerk

NOTICE OF ACTIONS TAKEN BY LEGISLATIVE RULE-MAKING REVIEW COMMITTEE

TO: Ken Hechler, Secretary of State, State Register
TO: Michael E. Caryl, Commissioner
State Tax Department
State Capitol
Charleston, Wv 25305

FROM: Legislative Rule-Making Review Committee

PROPOSED RULE: Appraisal of Property for Periodic Statewide
Reappraisals for Ad Valorem Property Tax Purpose

The Legislative Rule-Making Review Committee recommends that the West Virginia Legislature:

1. Authorize the agency to promulgate the Legislative Rule
 - (a) as originally filed
 - (b) as modified by the agency X
2. Authorize the agency to promulgate part of the Legislative rule; a statement of reasons for such recommendation is attached. _____
3. Authorize the agency to promulgate the Legislative rule with certain amendments; amendments and a statement of reasons for such recommendation is attached. _____
4. Authorize the agency to promulgate the Legislative rule as modified with certain amendments; amendments and a statement of reasons for such recommendation is attached. _____
5. Recommends that the rule be withdrawn; a statement of reasons for such recommendation is attached. _____

Pursuant to Code 29A-3-11(c), this notice has been filed in the State Register and with the agency proposing the rule.

cc: John Montgomery, Esquire
Tax Department